

**Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee
Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care**

**5TH INTERNATIONAL MEDICAL
WORKFORCE CONFERENCE**

November 2000

Papers

© Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee 2001

ISBN 0 7347 3291 0

This work is copyright. It may be reproduced in whole or part for study or training purposes subject to the inclusion of an acknowledgment of the source. Reproduction for purposes other than those indicated above requires the written permission of the paper authors and the Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee and the Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care.

Enquiries concerning this report and its reproduction should be directed to:

Executive Officer
Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee
c/- New South Wales Health Department
Locked Mail Bag 961
North Sydney NSW 2059
AUSTRALIA

Telephone: (+ 61 2) 9391 9933
E-mail: amwac@doh.health.nsw.gov.au
Internet: <http://amwac.health.nsw.gov.au>

Suggested citation:

Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee and Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care (2001), 5th International Medical Workforce Conference 2000: Papers, Sydney.

Publication and design by Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee.
Printing by Ligare, Sydney.

INTRODUCTION

We are pleased to present to you the papers from the 5th International Medical Workforce Conference, which was held in Sydney in November 2000, and jointly hosted by the Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee (AMWAC) and the Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care.

The general aims of the conference were to promote:

- the international collaboration in medical workforce research, evaluation and forecasting;
- an exchange of policy approaches across countries that address medical workforce planning and that enhance the ability of each country to respond to workforce needs; and
- an understanding of global trends that affect medical workforce policies.

The first international medical workforce conference was held in 1997, involving Canada, the United States and the United Kingdom. Australia participated for the first time the following year. Generally these four countries have been involved because of similarities in our health systems, approaches to workforce organisation and the commonality of the workforce challenges that each country faces.

Like the conference, the papers are structured around the five major conference sessions:

- medical workforce characteristics and policy update;
- assessment of doctors' performance in practice;
- dilemmas around the junior medical workforce;
- the role of the market in the clinical workforce; and
- workforce supply in underserved communities.

The choice of topics was determined by the organising committee and was based on issues of current relevance to each country and suggestions from last year's conference. Previous conferences had dealt with issues such as planning approaches, data collection, productivity, female participation, physician migration, telemedicine and substitution.

We would like to thank the authors for all of their hard work in preparing such thoughtful papers, and hope that they provide stimulating reading.

Professor John Horvath
AMWAC

Mr Bob Wells
Commonwealth Department of Health and
Aged Care

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	iii
Abbreviations	v
5th International Medical Workforce Conference Organising Committee	xi
Session 1: Medical Workforce Characteristics And Policy Update	1
The Australian Medical Workforce: Workforce Characteristics and Policy Update	3
Medical Workforce and Policy Update - Canada	19
The English National Health Service: A Profile of Developments and Plans for the Workforce	39
United States Medical Workforce: Characteristics and Policy Update	61
Session 2: Assessment Of Doctors' Performance In Practice	85
Assessment of Doctors' Performance - Australia	87
Assessment of the Performance of Practising Physicians in Canada	101
Measuring Doctors' Performance - United Kingdom	119
Session 3: Dilemmas Around The Junior Medical Workforce	135
Dilemmas in Junior Officer Training - Australia	137
Dilemmas Around the Junior Medical Workforce - Canada	143
Dilemmas Around the Junior Medical Workforce - United Kingdom	155
Dilemmas Around the Junior Workforce and the Indentured Service/ Apprenticeship Model for Graduate Medical Education in the United States	173
Session 4: The Role Of The Market In The Clinical Workforce	189
Market Forces: An Examination of the Australian Health Care Market and Its Impact on the Medical Workforce	191
The Role of the Marketplace in the Clinical Workforce - Canada	213
Markets and the United Kingdom Clinical Workforce: Problems of Supply Side Monopoly	243
The Role of the Marketplace in the Clinical Workforce of the United States	259
Session 5: Medical Workforce Supply In Underserved Communities	287
Underserved Communities - Australia	289
Access to Physicians in Underserved Communities in Canada: Something Old, Something New	329
Workforce Supply in Underserved Communities in the United Kingdom	363
Health Care Workforce Supply in Underserved Rural Areas of the United States	391

ABBREVIATIONS – AUSTRALIA

ACCHCs	Aboriginal Controlled Community Health Care Services
ACHS	Australian Council for Health Care Standards
ACT	Australian Capital Territory
AIHW	Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
AMC	Australian Medical Council
AMWAC	Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee
ARIA	Accessibility Remoteness Index of Australia
ATSI	Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander
CME	Continuing medical education
CPMC	Committee of Presidents of Medical Colleges
DHAC	Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care
FTE	Full time equivalent
GPs	General practitioners
HIC	Health Insurance Commission
MBS	Medical Benefits Schedule
MTRP	Medical Training Review Panel
NSW	New South Wales
NT	Northern Territory
OTD	Overseas trained doctor
PBS	Pharmaceutical Benefits Schedule
PGY	Postgraduate year
PIP	Practice Incentive Program
Qld	Queensland
RACGP	Royal Australian College of General Practitioners
RARA	Rural and Remote Areas classification
RFDS	Royal Flying Doctor Service
RHSET	Rural Health Support, Education and Training Program
RRMA	Rural Remote Metropolitan Areas classification
SA	South Australia
Tas	Tasmania
TRD	Temporary resident doctor
Vic	Victoria
WA	Western Australia

ABBREVIATIONS – CANADA

ACMC	Association of Canadian Medical Colleges
ACSCs	Ambulatory care sensitive conditions
AFPs	Alternative funding plans
APPs	Alternative payment plans
Alta	Alberta
BC	British Columbia
BCMA	British Columbia Medical Association
CA	Census agglomeration
CAPE	Clinical Assessment for Professional Enhancement (Manitoba)
CAPER	Canadian Postgraduate Medical Education Registry
CCP	Clinical Competence Program (British Columbia)
CCS	Consolidated Census subdivisions
CFPC	College of Family Physicians of Canada
CHCs	Community Health Centres
CIHI	Canadian Institute for Health Information
CLSCs	Centres locaux de services communautaires, Quebec
CMA	Canadian Medical Association
CMA	Census metropolitan area (in the Underserved Communities paper)
CMF	Canadian Medical Forum
CPSO	College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario
FFS	Fee for services
FMLAC	Federation of Medical Licensing Authorities of Canada
FPs	Family physicians
FTE	Full time equivalent
GPs	General practitioners
HSOs	Health Service Organizations
ICES	Institute for Clinical Evaluative Sciences

ABBREVIATIONS – CANADA continued

IMGs	International medical graduates
Man	Manitoba
MCC	Medical Council of Canada
MEPP	Monitoring and Enhancement of Physician Performance
MSB	Medical Services Branch, Health Canada
NB	New Brunswick
NCCPMT	National Coordinating Committee on Postgraduate Medical Education
Nfld	Newfoundland
NS	Nova Scotia
NWT	Northwest Territories
ODBP	Ontario Drug Benefits Plan
OHIP	Ontario Health Insurance Plan
Ont	Ontario
OSCEs	Objective structured clinical examinations
PAP	Peer Assessment Program
PAR	Physician Achievement Review Program (Alberta)
PEP	Practice Enhancement Program (Saskatchewan)
PEI	Prince Edward Island
PREP	Physician Review Program (Ontario)
Que	Quebec
RCPSC	Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada
RN	Registered nurse
SAP	Specialties Assessment Program (Ontario)
Sask	Saskatchewan
SMDB	Southam Medical Database
SMRs	Standardised mortality ratios
Yuk	Yukon Territory

ABBREVIATIONS – UNITED KINGDOM

AGMETS	Advisory Group on Medical and Dental Education, Training and Staffing
BMA	British Medical Association
CCST	Certificate of Completion of Specialist Training
CHI	Commission for Health Improvement
CPD	Continuing professional development
EU	European Union
GMC	General Medical Council
GPs	General practitioners
HES	Hospital Episode System
HImP	Health Improvement Program
HRGs	Health Related Groups
JPAC	Joint Planning Advisory Committee
LATS	London Academic Training Scheme
MADEL	Medical and Dental Education levy
MPC	Medical Practices Committee
NHS	National Health Service
NICE	National Institute of Clinical Excellence
NMET	Non-Medical Education Training levy
PCGs	Primary Care Groups
PCTs	Primary Care Trusts
PMS	Personal Medical Services
PRHO	Pre-Registration House Officers
RITAs	Records of In-service Training Assessments
SHO	Senior house officer
SIFT	Service increment for teaching
SMR	Standardised mortality ratio
SpR	Specialist registrars
SWAG	Specialist Workforce Advisory Group
UK	United Kingdom
UPA	Under-privileged area

ABBREVIATIONS – UNITED STATES

AAMC	Association of American Medical Colleges
ACGME	Accreditation Commission on Graduate Medical Education
AHECs	Area Health Education Centers
AMA	American Medical Association
AOA	American Osteopathic Association
BBA	Balanced Budget Act 1997
BBRA	Balanced Budget Refinement Act 1999
BHCAG	Buyer's Health Care Action Group
BHP _r	Bureau of Health Professions
CHCs	Community Health Centers (Clinics)
CHMSA	Critical Health Manpower Shortage Area
CME	Continuing medical education
COGME	Council on Graduate Medical Education
CON	Certificate of need
CSA	Clinical Skills Assessment
DME	Direct costs of medical education
DO	Osteopathic education
ECFMG	Educational Commission for Foreign Medical Graduates
ERISA	Employee Retirement and Income Security Act 1974
FFS	Fee for service
FPs	Family physicians
FQHCs	Federally-Qualified Health Centers
FTE	Full time equivalent
GDP	Gross domestic product
GPs	General practitioners
GME	Graduate medical education
GMENAC	Graduate Medical Education National Advisory Commission
HCFA	Health Care Financing Administration
HIPAA	Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act 1996
HMO	Health maintenance organization
HPSA	Health Professional Shortage Areas

ABBREVIATIONS – UNITED STATES continued

IME	Indirect costs of medical education
IMGs	International medical graduates
IOM	Institute of Medicine
IPAs	Independent Physician Associations
MD	Allopathic education
MedPAC	Medicare Payment Advisory Council
MSAs	Metropolitan statistical areas
MUA/Ps	Medically Underserved Areas and Populations
NHSC	National Health Service Corps
NPs	Nurse practitioners
NRMP	National Resident Matching Program
OMB	Office of Management and Budget
PAAs	Physician assistants
PCPs	Primary care physicians
PHO	Physician hospital organizations
PPM	Physician practice management companies
POs	Point of service plans
PPOs	Preferred provider organizations
PSAP	Physician Shortage Area Program
PSROs	Professional Standards Review Organizations
RBRVS	Resource-based relative value scales
RHCs	Rural health clinics
RRC	Residency Review Committee
RTTs	Rural training tracks
TOEFL	Test of English as a Foreign Language
US	United States
USMLE	United States Medical Licensing Examination
VA	Veterans Administration
WWAMI	Washington, Wyoming, Alaska, Montana, Idaho

5th INTERNATIONAL MEDICAL WORKFORCE CONFERENCE – ORGANISING COMMITTEE

AUSTRALIA

Professor John Horvath
Chairman, Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee

Mr Robert Wells
First Assistant Secretary, Health Industry and Investment Division,
Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care

Ms Justine Curnow
Senior Policy Officer, Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee

Mr Paul Gavel
Executive Officer, Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee

Ms Monica Pflaum
Workforce Education and Training Section, Health Industry and Investment Division
Commonwealth Department of Health and Aged Care

CANADA

Dr Morris Barer
Director, Centre for Health Services and Policy Research
Professor, Department of Health Care and Epidemiology, University of British Columbia

Ms Judith Dowler
Manager, Policy Development, Office of Rural Health, Health Canada

Dr Steve Gray
Medical Consultant, Legislation and Professional Regulation, Ministry of Health, British
Columbia

Dr Jean Parboosingh
Senior Medical Consultant, Health System Division, Health Policy Branch, Health Canada

UNITED KINGDOM

Dr John Biggs
Postgraduate Dean, East Anglian, University of Cambridge

Professor Alan Maynard
Professor of Health Economic, York Health Policy Group, University of York

Professor Graham Winyard
Postgraduate Dean, Wessex and Chair UK Specialist Workforce Advisory Group

UNITED STATES

Jerilyn Glass
Bureau of Health Professions

David Goodman, MD, MS
Associate Professor of Paediatrics, Dartmouth Medical School

Kevin Grumbach, MD
Chief, Family and Community Medicine
San Francisco General Hospital